

**NEW HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION AGENDA****Wednesday, December 9, 2020, Regular Meeting, 7:00 PM****Location: Web-based meeting via Zoom****Commissioner Trina Learned calls to order the public hearing at 7:01 PM.**

**In attendance:** Aicha Wood (City Plan), Maya Vardi (City Plan), Trina Learned (Commissioner and Chair), Tom Kimberly (Commissioner and Clerk), Susan Godshall (Commissioner), Doug Royalty (Commissioner), Karen Jenkins (Commissioner)

Commissioner Learned reviews New Haven's Zoom meeting HDC policies and procedures and the point of New Haven's local historic districts and the Historic District Commission.

**New Public Hearing**

1. 20-12-CA Owner: John R. Logan. Seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness for Removal of A Door, A Window, and A Staircase and Installation of a New Window and Railing on the building façade. At the Rear, Construction of a Deck on top of Existing Flat Roof, Reopening of Existing Window and Installation of New Doors and Railing at 69 East Pearl Street., Quinnipiac River Local Historic District.

**John R. Logan, 69 East Pearl Street, New Haven**

Mr. Logan says he purchased the house two years ago. He realizes the staircase on the front of the house is not in keeping with the style that would be historically there, so he wants it removed. He also intends to replace existing door and window on the front of the house (third floor) with double arch windows. On the back of the house, he wants to add a deck over the existing flat roof and intends to alter the back windows to include a door. New installed balustrade and balusters around back deck will match existing on front porch. Mr. Logan also says that he eventually wants to alter cornices to make historically accurate and reproduce other original details. He says he did meet with Elizabeth Holt.

Mr. Logan says siding of house will be repaired, not replaced.

Commissioner Learned asks for more information on windows being adding.

Mr. Logan says he wants to use rehabbed windows on the front of house, and he is still looking for what he will use. He says that as a backup, he spoke to a wood fabricator about creating custom wood windows that are historically accurate. In back, he intends to have large single glass panes, with no divided lights, but is unsure of exact model.

Commissioner Learned asks how the deck would attach to the flat roof and the structure below.

Mr. Logan says the roof needs to be repaired anyway, so it will be replaced, and structural supports will be attached.

Commissioner Learned says the Commission needs architectural details and drawings of deck.

Commissioners Godshall and Royalty say the cornice extension Mr. Logan has in his plans is too long.

Commissioner Godshall questions location of balustrade for balcony on front of house, second level. She suggests reducing the width of baluster to keep the façade intact (don't have it go past first level front porch column).

Commissioner Royalty inquires about plans for back windows. Mr. Logan says he will replace both existing windows and replace with two single pane glass windows on either side of glass double-door in center, all extending down to the deck. Mr. Logan does not have details on framing of windows and doors.

Commissioner Godshall suggested that all replaced railings have balustrades/balusters that match front porch.

Commissioner Royalty says the rear façade (including deck) will be an engineering task and Mr. Logan needs to review the visual element it takes to make the deck structurally sound. He also says that full glass, four panel windows seem to be a contemporary treatment and it may be worth thinking about a more traditional look (maybe French door). Commissioner Royalty also raises the question of the proportions regarding upper rear window.

The Commission says they need an explicit, detailed list of what Mr. Logan is asking to be approved, as well as the accompanying specifications

Commissioner Learned opens the discussion to public comment.

Elizabeth Holt, New Haven Preservation Trust, 922 State Street, says she is glad to see the applicant moving forward with the project. She says projects with this many details are a challenge, but the discussion and comments from the HDC have brought up a lot to think about. She says she will help Mr. Logan with the process of obtaining approval.

Commissioner Learned closes public comment.

Commissioner Kimberly moves to move the application to the January 13, 2021 HDC meeting.

Commissioner Royalty seconds.

### **All in favor 8:03pm**

2. 20-13-CA Owner: 20 Grand Avenue LLC, Karin Patriquin. Seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness for Installation of New Signage, Light Fixtures, and Mechanical Systems as well as Replacement of Door and Roof Shingles at 14 Grand Ave., Quinnipiac River Local Historic District.

**Karin Patriquin, 20 Grand Ave, New Haven**

Ms. Patriquin says the intent of the project is to get passive house retrofit certification. She says she wants to improve all parts of the envelope in the most respectful way, and is therefore doing everything on the inside, and not touching the exterior. Ms. Patriquin says she is adding insulated interior storm windows so don't need to touch exterior windows. Will keep large picture windows on the storefront, but wants to replace double-glazed windows. Wants to change entrance door to more insulated door, but with matching dimensions and profile to existing door. On Front Street side of building, she wants to change the sign to bronze Patriquin Architect sign. South side elevation will have mechanical equipment and have two light fixtures changed. Ms. Patriquin showed designs and cutsheets for all plans.

Commissioner Learned inquires if the current door is original and Ms. Patriquin says she doesn't know. Commissioner Learned says Ms. Patriquin's proposed fiberglass door will read as a new door. Commissioner Learned also says that cutting out brick in the back of the building and inserting louvers is an intrusive modern element and is concerning.

Commissioner Godshall says that green modifications should be given some leeway and compares the louvers to the installation of solar panels. Commissioner Learned disagrees and says the removal of 204-year-old bricks and inserting the louvers is a permanent modification.

The Commission discusses the placement of the louvers and Ms. Patriquin says there has already been a large amount of change on the south façade and she felt that side is the least visible which is why she selected that side for the louvers. The louver panels will be back 1 inch from the façade.

Commissioner Royalty expresses concern about replacing the door and inquires why Ms. Patriquin intends to use fiberglass rather than wood. Ms. Patriquin says that she wants to create a tight air barrier and fiberglass will be better for insulation. Commissioner Learned says that seeing as Ms. Patriquin is making all the other changes on the interior why isn't she inclined to create an interior vestibule rather than replace the door. Ms. Patriquin says she considered adding a vestibule, but it would be too jarring to the open floor plan on the interior.

Commissioner Godshall says she thinks some of the founders of New Haven Preservation Trust rescued the building in the 1970s when it was threatened with demolition and that the current door was installed then.

Commissioner Learned opens the discussion to public comment.

Elizabeth Holt, New Haven Preservation Trust, 922 State Street, says she agrees with Commissioner Godshall that the proposed louvers should be considered and that although the insertion of louvers is irrevocable, climate change is irrevocable too. She says she does not think the addition of louvers would be detrimental to the district as a whole and is in support of adding them.

Commissioner Learned closes public comment.

Commissioner Kimberly asks if the mail slot in front door breaches thermal insulation and Ms. Patriquin says she is asking USPS to deliver to the back door which is off a stairwell that is not part of the envelope. Ms. Patriquin inquires if she needs to add a mail slot to the new front door and the Commissions said she does not.

Commissioner Godshall moves to approve the application as submitted with the addition of the updated drawings of the replacement door.

Commissioner Kimberly seconds.

### **All in favor 8:50pm**

Discussion

3. Enforcement
  - 22 Hallock Ave

Ms. Vardi wrote a letter to Jim Turcio, New Haven Building Department, saying the HDC is concerned about porch stairs and railing built without Certificate of Appropriateness and building permit and asking him to look into it.

Commissioner Kimberly says the original pipe railings have not been disposed and they are leaning against the back of the house.

Commissioner Kimberly moves to approve the letter as submitted.

Commissioner Royalty seconds.

### **All in favor 8:55pm**

4. New 90 day demolition delay applications (currently 180 day delay)
  - 793 State Street

Failing structural integrity is reason for demolition. Was inspected by building department which considered emergency demolition and has pictures confirming poor interior condition. Currently unoccupied; proposing multi-family building for site.

5. Sec. 106

- 91 Shelton Ave. Proposed wireless communication facility modification

Building not on any lists, but more than 50 years old. Already tower present, but adding to it. Deadline to comment is 12/18/2020.

New Business

6. Approval of Draft Meeting Minutes- 11/18/2020

The Commissioners provide their changes to the recorder.

Commissioner Godshall moves to approve the minutes as amended.

Commissioner Kimberly seconds.

**All in favor 9:12pm**

Commissioner Godshall asks about status of Brewery Square.

Commissioner Jenkins says the “enforcement” letter was sent to the wrong address which delayed things. She says the work commenced on securing the gatehouse about a week ago.

Commissioner Learned asks if the HDC is pursuing anything regarding the Chestnut Street application. Ms. Wood says that dumpsters do not require a building permit, so she is still trying to figure out with Council how to respond.

Commissioner Learned moves to adjourn the meeting.

Commissioner Godshall seconds.

**All in favor 9:17pm**

Respectfully submitted by Kristen Hopewood, recorder.