

NEW HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Wednesday, February 8, 2023, Regular Meeting, 7:00 PM
Location: Web-Based Meeting via Zoom

Chair Trina Learned calls to order the public hearing at 7:01pm.

In Attendance: Laura Brown (City Plan Director), Fatima Cecunjanin (Staff to the Historic District Commission, Planner II), John Ward (Special Counsel to Economic Development), Trina Learned (Commissioner and Chair), Karen Jenkins (Commissioner), Susan Godshall (Commissioner), Richard Munday (Commissioner), Dylan Christopher (Commissioner), David Valentino (Commissioner), Sarah Tisdale (New Haven Preservation Trust)

1. Roll Call

Chair Learned reviews New Haven's Zoom meeting HDC policies and procedures and the point of New Haven's Local Historic Districts and the Historic District Commission (HDC).

2. Public Hearing

2.1 23-01-CA 98 South Water Street (MBLU: 232/ 0002/ 02000) City Point Local Historic District. Owner: Garrett Grant & Peter Maglaris. Seeking approval to fix alterations made to the barn without a CoA including: garage door and removed brickmould.

Garrett Grant, 555 Woodhouse Avenue, Wallingford

Mr. Grant introduced himself as the Commodore of the Pequonnock Yacht Club. Mr. Grant is seeking approval for the Pequonnock Yacht Club to fix the alterations made to the barn without a CoA, including the garage door and removed brickmould. Mr. Grant stated that the east side wood trim would be replaced to match the street side of the building, which faces south). There will be one-by-five-inch conventional square-edge casing around the window, identical to the original window casing. Mr. Grant states that the garage door on the west side of the building was replaced in the 1960s. The proposed garage barn door will be similar to the one at Thomas Oyster Company, in Mystic Seaport. The barn door would be a one-by-eight door with a square edge and Z-braces on the back side of the door. The door would be hinged on an overhead track, which would guide the door to swing to the left or the right. Mr. Grant says that the club is thinking that it would be best for it to swing to the right, because of all the cars parked at the

NEW HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Wednesday, February 8, 2023, Regular Meeting, 7:00 PM
Location: Web-Based Meeting via Zoom

restaurant. The club plans to leave the overhead door on the inside of the barn door for security purposes, though it will not be visible with the new door in place. Chair Learned asks if there was sufficient room for the door to open, as there is a window to the right of the door. Mr. Grant responds that there is enough room. Chair Learned asks if the overhead door was in place when the club bought the property in 2009. Mr. Grant responds that the door was installed in 2011. Mr. Grant states that not everyone at the yacht club is concerned with preserving this building, but that he is committed to saving the building. Chair Learned asks if there are questions from the commissioners.

Commissioner Christopher says that he noticed there was no casing on the garage door in the pre-2011 photographs, but there is after 2011. He asks Mr. Grant if they are planning to remove the white casing around the door. Mr. Grant says that they are not, but that the new door will cover the overhead door, so you will not see it from the outside. Chair Learned opens the floor for public comments.

Sarah Tisdale, 922 State Street, New Haven

Ms. Tisdale states that the New Haven Preservation Trust found a photograph of the façade of this building and that it did not originally have a door in place, just for historic reference. Additionally, the Thomas Oyster House that Mr. Grant referenced in his presentation was originally located in the City Point neighborhood of New Haven and was later moved to Mystic. Ms. Tisdale asks what the specifications for the locks and handles would be, as it was not clear in the presentation. Mr. Grant responds that the hardware will be identical to that of Thomas Oyster Company, which includes a conventional padlock and hasp, located on the right side.

Commissioner Godshall says that she may have missed something due to her internet disconnecting and asks if Mr. Grant was seeking approval for the swinging door or the sliding door. Chair Learned responds that Mr. Grant is seeking approval for the sliding door. Chair Learned applauds the yacht club for being good neighbors. With the building in a place of high visibility and with little historical significance, through the guidance of

NEW HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Wednesday, February 8, 2023, Regular Meeting, 7:00 PM
Location: Web-Based Meeting via Zoom

this process they have been sensible in undertaking its restoration. Chair Learned states that the presentation by Mr. Grant in this meeting shows how they responded to the advice from last month's meeting and that she is impressed with their work.

Chair Learned motions to approve parts two/three of the application.

Commissioner Valentino seconds.

Chair Learned and Commissioner Munday withdraw their voting statuses to achieve a five only vote.

All in favor at 7:27 PM.

Motion passes.

2.2 23-02-CA 82 Howard Avenue (MBLU: 233/ 0004/ 00900) City Point Local Historic District. Owner/Applicant: James Huffman. Seeking approval to replace right side of roof and temporarily replace front entrance door.

James Huffman, 121 Blue Hills Road, North Haven

Mr. Huffman states that he is seeking approval from the commission to replace the right side of the roof in a like-kind replacement. The roof was installed in 2010, with three-tab shingles and he is proposing to match those shingles as close as possible for the entire right side of the roof, which was damaged in a fire in 2020. Chair Learned asks if they are replacing the three-tab shingles with three-tab shingles. Mr. Huffman responds that yes they are, and that they are almost identical to what was used ten years ago. Chair Learned asks if Mr. Huffman has any visuals of the building. Mr. Huffman shares his screen and shows the state of the building and that there is a blue tarp currently covering the holes in the roof. Mr. Huffman states that there are two front doors to the building that have broken glass in them, and that he is seeking approval to repair them in place. He states that in the worst-case scenario, the doors would have to temporarily be taken off of the hinges to be replaced and will immediately be put back on once they are fixed. Chair Learned states that she sees this completely as a repair and like-for-like, replacing in kind. Chair Learned states that she does not think that this needs a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work to be done.

Chair Learned motions for the commission to deem this repair like-for-like and therefore not in need of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Valentino seconds.

Commissioner Christopher and Commissioner Jenkins withdraw their voting statuses to achieve a five only vote.

All in favor at 7:35 PM.

Motion passes.

2.3 23-03-CA 65 East Grand Avenue (MBLU: 098/ 1011/ 00900) Quinnipiac River Local Historic District. Owner: Pilgrim Congregational Church. Applicant: Paul Bastiaanse, Valley Restoration. Seeking approval to remove existing asphalt shingle roof and replace with GAF Timberline HDX color to match.

Paul Bastiaanse, 254 South Lake Street, Litchfield

Mr. Bastiaanse states that he is with Valley Restoration and is appearing on behalf of Pilgrim Congregational Church. For the sanctuary of the building, they are proposing to remove the existing architectural shingles and replace them with GAF architectural shingles in the same charcoal color that is there now. They will have to replace the existing flashing for new copper step flashing on the roof. Mr. Bastiaanse states that they will also have to replace the skirt of the steeple as well. This would be replacing the current cedar siding with the same, new cedar siding. They are also patching any soft spots or rotted areas in the decking and sealing it with two layers of ice and water shield. Mr. Bastiaanse restates that they are keeping everything the same, just replacing it with new material. He states that the church had an existing leak, which he believes is patched, but is still getting into the building. Chair Learned states that Mr. Bastiaanse has already answered many of their anticipated questions, but that she is wondering if there will be any dimension changes or anything that is not a close match to what is already there. Mr. Bastiaanse responds that there will be no dimension changes and that everything will match to what was there before. He states that the back area of the building was restored with these same conditions about four years ago, and that they are just trying to match the sanctuary with the rest of the building. Chair Learned opens the floor to commissioner comments. Commissioner Godshall asks what is under the shingles and if it is historic wood. Mr. Bastiaanse answers that it is one inch tongue-and-groove and that it is probably original to the late 1800s. Commissioner Godshall asks if restoring that is out of the question. Mr. Bastiaanse responds that that part of the roof is just the underlayment. He is not sure what would have been on there originally, either cedar or slate, but that whatever was originally on the roof is long gone. Chair Learned opens the floor for public comment.

Marjorie Shansky, 61 East Grand Avenue, New Haven

Ms. Shansky says that she shares two property lines with the church and asks how they plan on removing the roof, because she does not want damage to clean up. Mr. Bastiaanse

NEW HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Wednesday, February 8, 2023, Regular Meeting, 7:00 PM
Location: Web-Based Meeting via Zoom

responds that they are planning to create a dam on the side of the building that she shares a property line with and then rip from the bottom upwards and onto the other side of the street, in order to get it into the dumpsters that will be on that side. Ms. Shansky asks if they are using gravity to get it onto the other side. Mr. Bastiaanse responds that they are. Ms. Shansky asks if the building department has approved that. Mr. Bastiaanse answers that he has to get this approval from the Historic District Commission before he can do that. Ms. Shansky asks if notices about the historic district applications do not get sent out anymore. Chair Learned responds that she knows there are publications required, but the city staff would know more about this. Ms. Cecunjanin replies that she does not believe there are letters sent about the Certificates of Appropriateness applications. Ms. Brown says that, to her knowledge, there has not been any sent out since she has worked there. Chair Learned asks if this is an issue that needs to be resolved right now. Ms. Brown responds that the city staff will resolve it.

Chair Learned opens the floor to commissioner discussion. Chair Learned states that she believes it is a similar situation to the last application and that it seems like a repair like-for-like. Commissioner Christopher states that as a newer commissioner, he is a little confused about the like-for-like, asks what validates this work on a historic home. Chair Learned states that if work has been done on a structure before the historic district was created, such as the replacement of the roof on this church and is replaced with the same materials like-for-like, it does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness. Commissioner Munday agrees that he does not see this application as being different from the prior one, and he believes it should be handled in the same way. Commissioner Godshall states that she believes that they need to know a little bit more about the copper flashing and the six-foot storm guard. Mr. Bastiaanse says that they will replace the existing copper flashing with new copper flashing, because they do not know how old the existing one is. He states that the six-foot storm guard goes in the eaves underneath the roof and that the code is three feet, so they are doubling it for more protection. Commissioner Godshall asks what storm guard is. Mr. Bastiaanse responds that it is a three-foot roll of ice and water shield that protects the surface from ice damming and will protect the material underneath it. He states that it is not visible once the roof is put on. Commissioner Jenkins asks how Ms. Shansky is assured that there will not be debris on her property. Mr. Bastiaanse says that they are planning to create a dam on the side of the building that she shares a property line with and then rip from the bottom upwards and onto the other side of the street, in order to get it into the dumpsters that will be on that side. He says that it is a lot of extra cost for them to do it that way.

Chair Learned motions for the commission to deem this repair like-for-like and therefore not in need of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Munday seconds.

Commissioner Godshall and Commissioner Christopher withdraw their voting statuses to achieve a five only vote.

All in favor at 7:54 PM.

Motion passes.

3. Minutes

3.1 Approval of January 11, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Chair Learned says that she would like the minutes changes to reflect Commissioner Jenkins as Acting Chair for the meeting, her absence noted on the minutes, and a header and footer on all the pages to ensure that they stay together if printed.

Commissioner Valentino motions to pass the minutes as amended.

Commissioner Christopher seconds.

All in favor at 7:57 PM.

Motion passes.

4. New Business

Chair Learned states that she was enlightened to hear about the genuine care for the well-being of the relationship between the Historic District Commission and City Point in the last meeting. Chair Learned found an article from the Yale Law Journal, published in 2001 and states that it does a great job of talking about this relationship from a third-party perspective, and that she will send it to the commission and city staff as a resource.

Commissioner Jenkins states that she would like to perform a statistical analysis of how many times people come before the commission, and that many applicants come back several times before they get anything approved. Chair Learned states that the last time that was done, she performed it to seek information about a potential new historic district being added and wanted to see how people felt. She states that she went through agendas and minutes for a five-year period and found that there were two denials, for legitimate reasons to do with enforcement issues, during that five-year period. Chair Learned asks Ms. Brown how they would perform a task like this. Ms. Brown states that the city keeps records by address, so that they would need to go through the agendas individually to find out information, and that it is not impossible, but it will take time. Commissioner Jenkins says that she is willing to do the work and is interested in the number of times that people

NEW HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Wednesday, February 8, 2023, Regular Meeting, 7:00 PM
Location: Web-Based Meeting via Zoom

come before denial or approval. Commissioner Jenkins says that they should consider how to bring information to the public, so that more people are aware of the importance of the historic districts and the values of the commission. Commissioner Godshall states that a lot of criteria come into play with how many times people appear, and that sometimes it is because their application itself is insufficient and the applicants are poorly prepared, so the raw number of times people come before the commission may not be useful. Commissioner Jenkins says that she believes that information would be clear in the agenda if that were the case. Ms. Brown states that it seems like the intentions of this are to better assist applicants in the process and see how they could improve the process for applicants. She states that in the city plan department, they have implemented a department-wide survey that they use for general feedback that they can adapt for HDC use to better understand how applicants felt throughout the process and what could have been done to help them be more prepared for the public hearing. Chair Learned responds that that is a great idea. Commissioner Munday states that anything that can be done to not waste the commission's time and the applicant's time would be good. Commissioner Valentino says that in the City Point neighborhood, a lot of the residents are new, so they were not around when that article was written and were not informed about their responsibilities as homeowners in a historic district. Commissioner Valentino says that he has not heard a lot of good feedback about the commission and that he thinks homeowners would benefit from a list of exactly what they need to do to respect the historic district. Chair Learned says that City Point was made into a historic district for three reasons, including that it was a mechanism to keep I-95 from being expanded further, to keep the condo complex between the neighborhood and West Haven from expanding, and to preserve and enhance the property values. Chair Learned states that she believes around sixty-six percent of the people voted in favor of this, so it did not squeak by, and the commission needs to see what has changed since then. She states that she would love to see more collaboration between the commission and homeowners and that realtors need more education about what it means to live in a historic district. Commissioner Jenkins asks where the commission goes from here and states that there should not be people that come back more than twice. Chair Learned states that they

NEW HAVEN HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Wednesday, February 8, 2023, Regular Meeting, 7:00 PM
Location: Web-Based Meeting via Zoom

should not generalize the applicants, but that they need to clarify the process, which they will not be able to do tonight. Commissioner Godshall states that there are several districts not on the city's database and that she has seen new construction in two of those districts and thinks that at least one of them should have needed a Certificate of Appropriateness. Chair Learned responds that the commission can voice opinions on them, but that they do not issue Certificates of Appropriateness to National Register Historic District properties. Commissioner Godshall asks if there is a requirement for residents to be informed that they live in a National Register district. Chair Learned responds that there is not. Ms. Brown states that when people are going through the site plan review process that the City Plan department is diligent in providing them with historic resources during that process.

Chair Learned motions to adjourn.

Commissioner Valentino seconds.

All in favor at 8:22 PM.

Motion passes.

Respectfully submitted by Amelia Mower, recorder.